

# COMPLIANCE AUDIT

---

## Butler Township Municipal Employees' Pension Plan Butler County, Pennsylvania

---

October 2024



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania  
Department of the Auditor General  
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018  
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General  
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen  
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR  
AUDITOR GENERAL**

Board of Township Commissioners  
Butler Township  
Butler County  
Butler, PA 16001

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Butler Township Municipal Employees' Pension Plan pursuant to authority derived from the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (Act 205 of 1984, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.402(j)), which requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to audit every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited. The audit was not conducted, nor was it required to be, in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. We planned and performed the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the area related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- For the period January 1, 2023 to December 31, 2023, we determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the deposit date of state aid and determining whether the deposit was made within 30 days of receipt.

- For the period January 1, 2023 to December 31, 2023, we determined whether employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- For the period January 1, 2023 to December 31, 2023, we determined whether employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for the years in the period noted and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- For the period January 1, 2023 to December 31, 2023 we determined whether retirement benefits calculated for plan members who retired during the period noted represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws, and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefits due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2023 actuarial valuation report was prepared and submitted by March 31, 2024 in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on this report is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Butler Township contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for audits of its financial statements prepared in conformity with the accounting practices prescribed or permitted by the Department of Community and Economic Development of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, which are available at the township's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Butler Township Municipal Employees' Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously described, we tested transactions, interviewed selected officials, and performed procedures to the extent necessary to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Butler Township Municipal Employees' Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies for the periods noted above.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Butler Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Timothy L. DeFoor". The signature is written in a cursive style with a horizontal line above the first few letters.

Timothy L. DeFoor  
Auditor General  
September 25, 2024

## CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Supplementary Information .....	2
Report Distribution List .....	6

## BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a two percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Butler Township Municipal Employees' Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 331 - The First Class Township Code, Act of June 24, 1931 (P.L. 1206, No. 331), as amended, 53 P.S. § 55101 et seq.

The Butler Township Municipal Employees' Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 923, effective January 1, 2023. Prior to January 1, 2023, the plan was controlled by Ordinance No. 816, as amended. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its municipal employees. The plan was established September 1, 1967. Active participants hired prior to January 1, 2023, and subject to the defined benefit provisions of the fund, are required to contribute 3.0 percent of compensation to the plan. Active participants hired after January 1, 2023, and subject to the cash balance features of the pension fund, are required to contribute 4.0 percent of compensation into the fund and the municipality is required to contribute 7.5 percent of compensation per year. As of December 31, 2023, the plan had 25 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 25 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BUTLER TOWNSHIP MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2019, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-19	\$ 7,027,665	\$ 9,374,445	\$ 2,346,780	75.0%
01-01-21	8,570,647	10,048,093	1,477,446	85.3%
01-01-23	10,161,585	10,913,246	751,661	93.1%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-19, 01-01-21, and 01-01-23 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

BUTLER TOWNSHIP MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.



BUTLER TOWNSHIP MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER  
 AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2018	\$ 503,942	100.0%
2019	646,646	103.8%
2020	629,634	100.0%
2021	589,198	100.0%
2022	547,095	100.0%
2023	525,509	100.0%

BUTLER TOWNSHIP MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION  
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES  
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2023
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	3 years
Asset valuation method	Market value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.0%
Projected salary increases *	4.5%
Cost-of-living adjustments	2.0% of original retirement benefit

\* Includes inflation at 2.75%

BUTLER TOWNSHIP MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' PENSION PLAN  
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

**The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro**  
Governor  
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

**Mr. James Lokhaiser, Jr.**  
President, Board of Township Commissioners

**Mr. Sam Zurzolo**  
Vice President, Board of Township Commissioners

**Mr. Tom Knights**  
Township Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at [www.PaAuditor.gov](http://www.PaAuditor.gov). Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: [news@PaAuditor.gov](mailto:news@PaAuditor.gov).