# **COMPLIANCE AUDIT**

# Williamsburg Fireman's Relief Association Blair County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022

October 2024



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Theodore Hyle, President Williamsburg Fireman's Relief Association Blair County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Williamsburg Fireman's Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds. Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief association funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objective. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022, the relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.

Finding No. 1	_	Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System
Finding No. 2	_	Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster
Finding No. 3	_	Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings And Relief Association Bylaws
Finding No. 4	_	Inadequate Signatory Authority For The Disbursement Of Funds

We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. Detoor

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General September 27, 2024

# CONTENTS

Pag	<u>;e</u>
Background	.1
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System	.5
Finding No. 2 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster	.6
Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings And Relief Association Bylaws	.7
Finding No. 4 – Inadequate Signatory Authority For The Disbursement Of Funds	.9
Report Distribution List	1

## BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code<sup>1</sup>, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act<sup>2</sup> ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law<sup>3</sup> (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the relief association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the relief association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all relief association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the relief association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq*. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

# BACKGROUND - (Continued)

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipalities:

Municipality	County	2020	2021	2022
Catharine Township	Blair	\$4,489	\$4,083	\$5,169
Williamsburg Borough	Blair	\$5,197	\$4,675	\$5,629
Woodbury Township	Blair	\$9,420	\$8,475	\$9,530

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash and investments as of December 31, 2022, were \$42,705, as illustrated below:

Cash	\$ 20,202
Fair Value of Investments	 22,503
Total Cash and Investments	\$ 42,705

#### **BACKGROUND – (Continued)**

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2022, were \$58,031, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.<sup>4</sup> The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	\$ 17,993
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 14,707
Equipment maintenance	9,549
Training expenses	5,051
Total Fire Services	\$ 29,307
Administrative Services:	
Bond premiums	\$ 695
Other administrative expenses	 1,002
Total Administrative Services	\$ 1,697
Other Expenditures:	
Payments on loan	\$ 9,000
Unauthorized expenditure *	34
Total Other Expenditures	\$ 9,034
Total Expenditures	\$ 58,031

Expenditures:

\* During calendar year 2022, the relief association made an insignificant disbursement in the amount of \$34 for the unauthorized payment of sales tax on a purchase that was authorized under the VFRA Act. We disclosed this issue to relief association officials on January 29, 2024, but we did not include a finding in this report due to the relatively low dollar amount.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

# BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Williamsburg Area Volunteer Fire Company

# Finding No. 1 – Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association's financial record-keeping system did not establish adequate accounting procedures to allow the membership to effectively monitor the relief association's financial operations. The following are the noted deficiencies:

- Bank statements were not provided for the period of January 1, 2020, to September 15, 2021.
- Although loan payments were made, statements supporting the relief association's annual loan payments during the audit period were not maintained.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states:

A volunteer firefighters' relief association may be a body corporate, governed by a charter and bylaws or an unincorporated association of individuals governed by bylaws and a constitution. In either case, it must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

In addition, an adequate system of accounting and record-keeping is a prerequisite for sound administration of relief association assets.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials stated that some bank statements were unavailable when the bank's ownership changed. The relief association officials did not provide a reason why supporting documentation for loan payments was not maintained.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure of relief association officials to maintain adequate records prohibits the membership from effectively monitoring the relief association's financial operations.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials establish and maintain a financial record-keeping system that allows the membership to effectively monitor the relief association's financial operations, including the maintenance of a journal, ledgers, and bank statements. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and as of October 11, 2023, the loan was liquidated.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

# Finding No. 2 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Although a listing of relief association owned equipment was provided during the current audit, it was incomplete because it did not contain the names of suppliers (vendors), dates of purchase, and cost of equipment to accurately identify equipment owned by the relief association. As such, it was impossible to determine if all equipment purchased during the audit period in the amount of \$14,707 was recorded. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis to account for the equipment owned by the relief association.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association and perform and document an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials stated they were unaware their roster was not sufficient. In addition, the relief association officials did not provide a reason why annual inventories were not conducted.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

# **Finding No. 2 – (Continued)**

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

# Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings And Relief Association Bylaws

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain detailed minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. Specifically, the relief association's minutes did not address all financial-related transactions that occurred during the audit period. In addition, the meeting minutes were not signed and dated by the recording officer. Furthermore, the existing bylaws of the relief association contain language to conduct business that is based on Act 84 of June 11, 1968. The relief association has not updated the bylaws to govern their organization to meet the requirements set forth in the VFRA Act.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that the relief association:

... must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

The relief association's bylaws at Article III, Section 3 states, in part:

Secretary: The Secretary shall keep a true record of the proceedings of every meeting in the minutes. The minutes shall note authorization by the membership of all association financial transactions and all other business discussed at the association meetings.

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article V, Section 1 states:

Funds of this association shall not be expended for any purpose other than those authorized by the provisions of Act 84 and the association bylaws. All expenditures must be approved by a majority vote at an association meeting and duly recorded in the minutes.

# **Finding No. 3 – (Continued)**

Furthermore, the relief association's bylaws at Article VI, Section 1 states, in part:

Funds of this association may be invested in any security authorized by the provisions of Section 6(c) of Act 84. All purchases and sales of investments must be made in a prudent manner to insure maximum investment return and authorized by a majority vote at an association meeting. The transactions must be duly recorded in the minutes.

In addition, prudent business practice dictates that the relief association officials should ensure that meeting minutes are signed and dated.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials stated they were unaware their meeting minutes were inadequate.

<u>Effect</u>: Without detailed minutes of meetings that address all financial-related transactions and that are signed and dated, evidence that relief association business was presented before the membership for approval does not exist. As a result of the relief association not updating the bylaws to meet the appropriate requirements, the relief association may have conducted its affairs without proper authorization.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain detailed minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws, evidencing the discussion and approval of all financial-related business conducted by the relief association. We also recommend that the relief association officials ensure that all meeting minutes are signed and dated by the Secretary of the Relief Association to ensure the validity of the meeting minutes. In addition, we recommend that the relief association officials remove the language referring to Act 84 by updating the bylaws governing their organization so that the bylaws meet the requirements set forth in the VFRA Act. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

#### Finding No. 4 – Inadequate Signatory Authority For The Disbursement Of Funds

<u>Condition</u>: During the current audit engagement, the relief association had 46 checks drawn from their checking account; however, only ten of those checks were available for examination in the year 2022. Of those ten checks that were examined, we identified eight drawn on the relief association's checking account that only contained the signature of one officer (the Relief Association treasurer), even though two signatures are required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. Issuing checks with the signature of only one relief association officer negates the relief association's internal control over the disbursement process.

Criteria: Section 7415(c)(3) of the VFRA Act states, in part:

The bylaws shall require that the signatures of at least two officers, one of whom shall be the disbursing officer, shall be required to bind the association by formal contract or to issue a negotiable instrument.

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article VII, Section 1 states:

The signatures of at least two officers, one of whom shall be the Treasurer, shall be required for the issuance of relief association checks, withdrawal from the association savings account, the redemption of any relief association investment, or on any other negotiable instrument issued by the association.

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that the relief association has sufficient internal control procedures in place to ensure the signatures of at least two relief association officials are included on all negotiable instruments. Adequate internal control procedures require that checks be signed only after the propriety of the expenditure has been determined and the payee, date, and amount to be paid has been confirmed. Additionally, responsible relief association officers should compare this information with supporting documentation, such as invoices, contracts, etc., prior to approving the checks.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials stated that they believed they only needed one signer on checks when they changed banks.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the relief association officers issuing checks with only one authorized signature, assets were placed at greater risk as expenditures were being made without a second relief association officer having the opportunity to verify the propriety of the expenditures. The application of the second authorized signature, after evaluating the propriety of the expenditure, reduces the risk of misappropriation and the risk of errors occurring and going undetected.

# **Finding No. 4 – (Continued)**

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure that the signatures of at least two authorized relief association officers, one of whom shall be the Treasurer, are included on all relief association negotiable instruments as defined by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

## WILLIAMSBURG FIREMAN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

## The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Williamsburg Fireman's Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Theodore Hyle President

# Ms. Elizabeth Eastep Secretary

#### Mr. Justin Isenberg Treasurer

The following municipalities allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association and received a copy of this report:

Ms. Heather J. Flaig Secretary Catharine Township

Mr. Joseph Lansberry Secretary Williamsburg Borough

Ms. Kelsie Lego Secretary Woodbury Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.PaAuditor.gov.</u> Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: <u>news@PaAuditor.gov</u>.