

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Daugherty Township Volunteer Fire Department Relief Association Beaver County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2023

July 2025



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR
AUDITOR GENERAL**

Mr. Justin Stone, President
Daugherty Township Volunteer Fire
Department Relief Association
Beaver County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Daugherty Township Volunteer Fire Department Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2023. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report.
2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief association funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

We were not able to obtain an independent confirmation of a portion of the cash balance and the investment balance directly from the financial institutions. Therefore, while the relief association provided bank and investment statements that indicated that, as of December 31, 2023, the relief association had a cash balance of \$22,730 and an investment balance with a fair value of \$66,542, we were not able to verify a portion of the cash balance and the investment balance.

We were also not able to obtain copies of canceled or imaged checks from the relief association. While the relief association provided copies of bank statements, the relief association failed to provide copies of canceled or imaged checks. Without copies of canceled or imaged checks, we were not able to determine whether two relief association officers authorized and signed the checks as required by the VFRA Act.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2023:

- The relief association did not take appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior audit report, as detailed below, and discussed in the Status of Prior Finding section of this report.
- Except for the effects, if any, of the matters described in the two preceding paragraphs, the relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure
To Maintain Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage

Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditures

Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System

Finding No. 4 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Cumulative
Equipment Roster

We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Timothy L. DeFoor". The signature is written in a cursive style with a horizontal line above the first name.

Timothy L. DeFoor
Auditor General
June 2, 2025

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Status of Prior Finding	4
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage.....	5
Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditures	6
Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System.....	7
Finding No. 4 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Cumulative Equipment Roster	8
Report Distribution List	10

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania,¹ Section 403 of The Fiscal Code,² and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"),³ the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law, commonly referred to as Act 205,⁴ are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the relief association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the relief association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all relief association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the relief association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipality:

<u>Municipality</u>	<u>County</u>	<u>2020</u>	<u>2021</u>	<u>2022</u>	<u>2023</u>
Daugherty Township	Beaver	\$16,119	\$14,519	\$17,472	\$17,546

¹ Pa. Const. Art. VIII § 10.

² 72 P.S. § 403.

³ 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq.*

⁴ 53 P.S. § 895.701 *et seq.*

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash and investments as of December 31, 2023, were \$89,272, as illustrated below:

Cash	\$ 22,730
Fair Value of Investments	<u>66,542</u>
Total Cash and Investments	<u>\$ 89,272</u>

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2020, to December 31, 2023, were \$105,469, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.⁵ **The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.**

Expenditures:

Benefit Services:	
Insurance premiums	<u>\$ 8,193</u>
Fire Services:	
Equipment purchased	\$ 36,524
Equipment maintenance	965
Training expenses	<u>950</u>
Total Fire Services	<u>\$ 38,439</u>
Administrative Services:	
Bond premiums	\$ 884
Other administrative expenses	<u>8</u>
Total Administrative Services	<u>\$ 892</u>
Other Expenditures:	
Payments on loan	\$ 57,357
Undocumented expenditures – See Finding No. 2	<u>588</u>
Total Other Expenditures	<u>\$ 57,945</u>
Total Expenditures	<u>\$ 105,469</u>

⁵ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organization are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organization:

Daugherty Township Volunteer Fire Department

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

The relief association has not complied with the following prior audit finding. This finding is noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

- Insufficient Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage

Although the relief association complied with the prior audit finding by increasing the Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage to an amount greater than the balance of the relief association's maximum cash assets, the relief association again failed to monitor their Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage in the current audit period as further disclosed in Finding No. 1 of this report.

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage

Condition: Although the relief association complied with the prior audit finding by increasing the Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage to an amount greater than the balance of the relief association's maximum cash assets, the relief association again failed to monitor their Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage in the current audit period. Specifically, the relief association failed to maintain Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage on its authorized disbursing officer, as required by the VFRA Act. The relief association's Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage expired on August 13, 2023. As of December 31, 2023, the relief association's cash assets totaled \$22,730. Subsequent to the period under review, a new Surety (Fidelity) bond policy went into effect on November 20, 2024.

A similar condition was noted in our two prior audit reports.

Criteria: Section 7415(c)(4) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that:

. . . the disbursing officer, whether designated treasurer, comptroller, financial secretary or otherwise, shall be bonded by corporate surety for faithful performance of duty. The amount of the bond shall be at least as great as the maximum cash balance in current funds of the association at any time during the fiscal year, and the premium on the bond shall be a proper charge against the funds of the association.

Cause: The relief association officials did not provide a reason why this occurred despite the relief association being notified of this condition during our prior audit.

Effect: As a result of the authorized disbursing officer of the relief association not being bonded, the relief association's cash assets were not adequately safeguarded.

Recommendation: We again recommend that the relief association officials maintain Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage on the relief association's authorized disbursing officer in an amount greater than the relief association's maximum cash balance, as required by the VFRA Act. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and the relief association purchased bond coverage in an amount greater than the relief association's maximum cash balance on November 20, 2024.

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

Auditor's Conclusion: We reviewed documentation verifying that bond coverage was obtained on November 20, 2024. Compliance for maintaining bond coverage during the next audit period will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 2 – Undocumented Expenditures

Condition: The relief association was unable to provide adequate supporting documentation for the following expenditures made during the current audit period:

<u>Date</u>	<u>Check No.</u>	<u>Payee Description</u>	<u>Amount</u>
03/24/2021	398	Unknown vendor	\$ 340
06/10/2021	399	Unknown vendor	248
Total			<u>\$ 588</u>

Criteria: Section 7418(a) of the VFRA Act states:

The Office of Auditor General shall have the power and its duty shall be to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association receiving money under Chapter 7 of the Act of December 18, 1984 (P.L. 1005, No. 205), known as the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act, as far as may be necessary to satisfy the Auditor General that the money received was or is being expended for no purpose other than that authorized by this subchapter. Copies of all audits shall be furnished to the Governor.

Prudent business practice dictates that supporting documentation be maintained to evidence the propriety of all financial transactions.

Cause: The relief association officials indicated that the new treasurer did not make all the copies needed for the audit.

Effect: Lack of supporting documentation, such as invoices and itemized receipts, made it impossible to determine if the expenditures were made in accordance with Section 7416(f) of the VFRA Act. In addition, the failure to maintain adequate supporting documentation for relief association expenditures can lead to an increased risk of errors occurring and funds being misappropriated.

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials provide this department with adequate supporting documentation, such as invoices and/or itemized receipts, to ensure the propriety of the expenditures or that the relief association be reimbursed \$588 for the undocumented expenditures. We also recommend that the relief association officials maintain supporting documentation for all future expenditures. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 3 – Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System

Condition: The relief association's financial record-keeping system did not establish adequate accounting procedures to allow the membership to effectively monitor the relief association's financial operations. The following are the noted deficiencies:

- A journal was not maintained to record the receipts and disbursements of the relief association.
- Ledgers were not utilized to record the transactions of the relief association accounts.
- Documentation to support various expenditures was not available for examination at the time of the audit.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states:

A volunteer firefighters' relief association may be a body corporate, governed by a charter and bylaws or an unincorporated association of individuals governed by bylaws and a constitution. In either case, it must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

In addition, an adequate system of accounting and record-keeping is a prerequisite for sound administration of relief association assets.

Cause: Relief association officials indicated that the new treasurer was not informed about all required record-keeping.

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

Effect: The failure of relief association officials to maintain adequate records prohibits the membership from effectively monitoring the relief association's financial operations.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials establish and maintain a financial record-keeping system that allows the membership to effectively monitor the relief association's financial operations. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 4 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Cumulative Equipment Roster

Condition: The relief association did not maintain a complete and accurate cumulative roster of equipment owned by the relief association. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis, nor whether such inventory accounted for all equipment owned by the relief association.

Criteria: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association and perform and document an annual physical inventory of all equipment in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 4 – (Continued)

Cause: The relief association officials indicated that they did not keep up to date with an equipment roster.

Effect: Failure to properly record equipment purchases in a complete and accurate cumulative equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

Recommendation: We recommend that the relief association officials maintain a complete and accurate cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of an annual physical inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Management's Response: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

DAUGHERTY TOWNSHIP VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT RELIEF ASSOCIATION
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Daugherty Township Volunteer Fire Department Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Justin Stone
President

Mr. James Stone
Vice President

Mr. Jarrod Druschel
Treasurer

A report was also distributed to the following municipality, which allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association:

Mr. Eric Wayne Bock
Secretary
Daugherty Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.