COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Conyngham Township Fireman's Relief Association Columbia County, Pennsylvania

For the Period January 1, 2021, to December 31, 2023

September 2024



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018 Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General Twitter: @PAAuditorGen www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. Joseph Pavloski, President Conyngham Township Fireman's Relief Association Columbia County

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Conyngham Township Fireman's Relief Association (relief association) for the period January 1, 2021, to December 31, 2023. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Section 403 of The Fiscal Code, 72 P.S. § 403; and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act ("VFRA Act"), see 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418.

The objectives of the audit were:

- 1. To determine if the relief association took appropriate corrective action to address the findings contained in our prior audit report.
- 2. To determine if the relief association complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above and was not, nor was it required to be, conducted in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States.

Relief association officers are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the relief association's administration of state aid and accumulated relief association funds complies with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures, including the safeguarding of assets. Relief association officers are responsible for complying with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures. It is our responsibility to perform procedures to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to the extent necessary to satisfy the audit objectives. We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

Based on our audit procedures, we conclude that, for the period January 1, 2021, to December 31, 2023:

- The relief association took appropriate corrective action to address four of the eight findings contained in our prior audit report. However, the relief association failed to take appropriate corrective action to address the four remaining findings contained in our prior audit report, as listed below, and discussed in the Status of Prior Findings section of this report.
- The relief association, in all significant respects, complied with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds, except as noted in the findings listed below and discussed later in this report.

Finding No. 1	_	Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation - Failure to
		Maintain Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage

- Finding No. 2 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation Failure To Maintain A Pennsylvania Sales Tax Exemption Number
- Finding No. 3 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings And Inadequate Relief Association Bylaws
- Finding No.4 Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster
- Finding No. 5 Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid
- Finding No.6 Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Membership Roster

Four of the six audit findings contained in this report cite conditions that existed in the operation of the relief association during the prior audit period and were not corrected during the current audit period. We are concerned by the number of findings noted and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendations noted in this audit report.

The contents of this report were discussed with the management of the relief association and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank the relief association officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

Timothy L. Detoor

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General July 26, 2024

CONTENTS

	Page
Background	1
Status of Prior Findings	4
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage	5
Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Pennsylvania Sales Tax Exemption Number	6
Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain Minutes Of Meetings And Inadequate Relief Association Bylaws	7
Finding No. 4 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster	9
Finding No. 5 – Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid	10
Finding No. 6 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Membership Roster	11
Report Distribution List	13

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Article VIII, Section 10 of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Section 403 of The Fiscal Code¹, and the Volunteer Firefighters' Relief Association Act² ("VFRA Act"), the Department of the Auditor General's duty is to audit the accounts and records of every volunteer firefighters' relief association to determine that funds received under the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution Law³ (commonly referred to as Act 205) are properly expended.

The relief association is a charitable organization that was formed primarily to afford financial protection to volunteer firefighters and to encourage individuals to participate in volunteer fire service.

The VFRA Act governs the overall operation of volunteer firefighters' relief associations. Relief association bylaws define the specific operational procedures by which relief associations conduct business. To fulfill its primary purpose, the VFRA Act authorizes specific types of expenditures and prescribes appropriate volunteer firefighters' relief association investment options. Within the parameters established by the VFRA Act, it is the responsibility of relief associations to choose investments in a proper and prudent manner.

Volunteer firefighters' relief associations receive public tax monies, and the relief association officers therefore have a responsibility to the public to conduct the relief association's financial affairs in a businesslike manner and to maintain sufficient financial records to support the propriety of all relief association transactions. Volunteer firefighters' relief association officers are also responsible for ensuring that the relief association operates in accordance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures.

Act 205 sets forth the computation of the Foreign Fire Insurance Tax Distribution paid to each applicable municipality throughout the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The amount of the distribution is based upon the population of each municipality and the market value of real estate within the municipality. Upon receipt of this distribution, the municipality must allocate the funds to the volunteer firefighters' relief association of the fire service organization or fire service organizations that is or are recognized as providing the service to the municipality.

¹ 72 P.S. § 403 (as last amended by Act 44 of 2017).

² 35 Pa.C.S. § 7411 *et seq*. See specifically, 35 Pa.C.S. § 7418 (amended by Act 91 of 2020).

³ 53 P.S. § 895.701 et seq. (Act 205 of 1984, as amended by Act 119 of 1990).

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The relief association was allocated state aid from the following municipality:

Municipality	County	2021	2022	2023
Conyngham Township	Columbia	\$2,778	\$3,162*	\$3,235

* The 2022 state aid allocation received from Conyngham Township was not deposited by the relief association until May 25, 2023, as disclosed in Finding No. 6 in this report.

Based on the relief association's records, its total cash and investments as of December 31, 2023, were \$70,937, as illustrated below:

Cash	\$ 33,528
Fair Value of Investments	 37,409
Total Cash and Investments	\$ 70,937

Based on the relief association's records, its total expenditures for the period January 1, 2021, to December 31, 2023, were \$174, as noted below. The accuracy of these expenditures was evaluated as part of the Department's audit to conclude on the relief association's compliance with applicable state laws, contracts, bylaws, and administrative procedures as they relate to the receipt of state aid and the expenditure of relief association funds.⁴ The scope of the Department's audit does not include the issuance of an opinion on the accuracy of these amounts.

Expenditures:

Administrative Services: Other administrative expenses	\$ 174
Total Expenditures	\$ 174

⁴ Accuracy was evaluated for a selection of transactions based on dollar amount, category, and/or random selection.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

The volunteer firefighters' relief association and the affiliated fire service organizations are separate, legal entities. The relief association is affiliated with the following fire service organizations:

Aristes Fire Company

Locustdale Fire Company

Wilburton Fire Company No. 1

CONYNGHAM TOWNSHIP FIREMAN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

COMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has complied with four of the eight prior audit findings and recommendations, as follows:

• <u>Undocumented Expenditures</u>

By providing adequate documentation to evidence the propriety of the undocumented expenditures that were made in the prior audit period.

Failure To Disclose A Related Party Transaction

By not having any related party transactions during the audit current period.

• Inadequate Signatory Authority For The Disbursement Of Funds

By not issuing any checks during the audit current period.

• Inadequate Financial Record-Keeping System And Inadequate Internal Controls

By maintaining a financial record-keeping system that allows the membership to effectively monitor the relief association's financial operations.

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH PRIOR AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The relief association has not complied with four of the eight prior audit findings. These findings are noted below and discussed in detail in the Findings and Recommendations section of this report:

- Failure To Maintain Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage
- Failure To Maintain A Pennsylvania Sales Tax Exemption Number
- Inadequate Minutes Of Meetings
- Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster

We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct those previously reported audit findings. The relief association management should strive to implement the recommendations and corrective actions noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 1 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain</u> <u>Surety (Fidelity) Bond Coverage</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage on its authorized disbursing officer, as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. The relief association's Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage expired on November 8, 2018. As of December 31, 2023, the relief association's cash assets totaled \$33,528.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

Criteria: Section 7415(c)(4) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that:

. . . the disbursing officer, whether designated treasurer, comptroller, financial secretary or otherwise, shall be bonded by corporate surety for faithful performance of duty. The amount of the bond shall be at least as great as the maximum cash balance in current funds of the association at any time during the fiscal year, and the premium on the bond shall be a proper charge against the funds of the association.

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article VII, Section 2 states:

The association shall maintain an officer's bond on the treasurer. The amount of the bond shall be at least as great as the maximum cash balance in current funds of the association at any time during the fiscal year.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that there was a lack of certainty on the requirements.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the authorized disbursing officer of the relief association not being bonded, the relief association's cash assets were not adequately safeguarded.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials obtain Surety (Fidelity) bond coverage on the relief association's authorized disbursing officer in an amount greater than the relief association's maximum cash balance, as required by the VFRA Act. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 2 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain</u> <u>A Pennsylvania Sales Tax Exemption Number</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association failed to maintain a Pennsylvania sales tax exemption number. Although the relief association did have its own sales tax exemption number, it expired on April 30, 2010, and is no longer valid.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

Criteria: Section 7415(e) of the VFRA Act states:

A volunteer firefighters' relief association organized or conducted in accordance with the requirements of this section shall be regarded as a charitable corporation for all purposes, including the right to establish exemption from the operation of certain taxes.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that they were unable to locate its current sales tax exemption certificate number to assist with revising with the Pennsylvania Department of Revenue.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the relief association's continued failure to maintain a sales tax exemption number, the relief association may be required to pay Pennsylvania sales tax on their purchases, which ultimately reduces the funds otherwise available for general operating expenditures or for investment purposes.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials immediately reapply for a new state sales tax exemption number from the Department of Revenue and furnish this exemption number to all vendors from whom the relief association purchases equipment. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 3 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation –- Failure To Maintain</u> <u>Minutes Of Meetings And Inadequate Relief Association Bylaws</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not hold meetings and did not maintain minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws. Furthermore, the existing bylaws of the relief association contains language to conduct business pertaining to the disbursement, investment, and purchase of funds that is based on Act 84 of June 11, 1968. The relief association has not updated the bylaws to govern their organization to meet the requirements set forth in the VFRA Act.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

Criteria: Section 7415(a) of the VFRA Act states, in part, that the relief association:

... must provide for taking and preserving minutes of all meetings and maintenance of such books of account as may be necessary and appropriate to afford a permanent record of its fiscal affairs.

The relief association's bylaws at Article II, Section 1 states:

Meetings of the Conyngham Township Fireman's Relief Association shall be held quarterly per year. Meetings will be held the fourth Thursday of the month.

The relief association's bylaws at Article III, Section 4 also states, in part:

Secretary – Shall keep records of all financial transactions discussed at association meetings.

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

In addition, the relief association's bylaws at Article V, Section 1 states, in part:

Funds of this association shall not be expended for any purpose other than those authorized by the provisions of Act 84 and the association bylaws.

Furthermore, the relief association's bylaws at Article VI, Section 1 states, in part:

Funds of this association may be invested in any security authorized by the provision of Section 6 (C) of Act 84.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated they did not feel the need to hold meetings due to the lack of expenditures during the audit period.

<u>Effect</u>: Without holding regular meetings and maintaining detailed minutes of meetings, evidence that relief association business was presented before the membership for approval does not exist. As a result of the relief association not updating the bylaws to meet the appropriate requirements, the relief association may have conducted its affairs without proper authorization.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials hold all required meetings and maintain detailed minutes of meetings as required by the VFRA Act and the relief association's bylaws, evidencing the discussion and approval of all financial-related business conducted by the relief association. In addition, we recommend that the relief association officials remove the language referring to Act 84 by updating the bylaws governing their organization so that the bylaws meet the requirements set forth in the VFRA Act. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

<u>Finding No. 4 – Noncompliance With Prior Audit Recommendation – Failure To Maintain</u> <u>A Complete And Accurate Equipment Roster</u>

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not maintain a complete and accurate roster of equipment owned by the relief association. Although a listing of relief association owned equipment was provided and no equipment was purchased during the current audit, some previously purchased inventory items and information recommended to be included on the roster in the prior audit report was not included on the roster as recommended. In addition, there was no indication that a physical inventory of equipment was conducted on an annual basis, nor whether such inventory accounted for all equipment owned by the relief association.

A similar condition was noted in our prior audit report.

<u>Criteria</u>: Prudent business practice dictates that the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure the maintenance of a cumulative equipment roster of all items purchased by the relief association and perform and document an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment in order to provide an effective accounting control over the relief association's equipment. A cumulative equipment roster of all relief association equipment should include all the following:

- Types of equipment purchased
- Dates of purchase
- Unit costs
- Names of suppliers
- Serial numbers, if applicable
- Current locations of items
- Final dispositions of sold or damaged equipment
- Evidence of the performance and results of an annual physical inventory

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials indicated that they didn't update the roster because nothing new was purchased. However, they did not provide a reason why the roster did not include certain items purchased during prior audits, the location of equipment, or why an annual inventory was not performed, despite the relief association being notified of these conditions during our prior audit.

<u>Effect</u>: The continued failure to properly record equipment purchases in a detailed equipment roster prevents officials from effectively monitoring the relief association's equipment purchases. In addition, the failure to maintain a detailed equipment roster and perform an annual physical inventory of equipment prevents adequate accountability for, and safeguarding of, relief association equipment.

Finding No. 4 – (Continued)

<u>Recommendation</u>: We again recommend that the relief association officials maintain a cumulative equipment roster of all equipment owned by the relief association. Furthermore, the relief association should ensure it performs an annual physical inventory of all operable equipment and that the completion of the inventory be sufficiently documented. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

<u>Auditor's Conclusion</u>: We are concerned by the relief association's failure to correct this previously reported audit finding and strongly encourage timely implementation of the recommendation noted in this audit report.

Finding No. 5 - Untimely Receipt And Deposit Of State Aid

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association did not deposit the 2022 state aid allocation it received from Conyngham Township, in the amount of \$3,162, until May 25, 2023. The foreign fire insurance tax allocation was distributed to the municipal treasurer on September 21, 2022; however, municipal officials failed to forward the state aid allocation to the relief association until March 9, 2023, which is not within 60 days of receipt, as required by Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205). The relief association had no documentation that it had attempted to obtain the funds from the township. In addition, upon receipt of the state aid allocation, the relief association did not ensure the funds were deposited timely into a relief association account.

Criteria: Section 706 (b)(2) of the Act of December 18, 1984, (P.L. 1005, No. 205), states:

The foreign fire insurance premium tax amount applicable to a municipality served solely by volunteer firefighters shall be paid to the municipality, which shall within 60 days of the date of the receipt of the moneys from the State Treasurer pay the amount received to the relief association fund of the fire department or departments, or fire company or companies, now existing or hereafter organized, inside or outside of the municipality, which is or are actively engaged in the service of the municipality and duly recognized by the governing body of the municipality.

Finding No. 5 – (Continued)

Furthermore, prudent business practice dictates that the relief association officials should be questioning the municipality about their state aid if only one relief association is in the fire service area and upon receipt of its state aid allocation, the relief association should establish adequate internal control procedures to ensure state aid funds are obtained and deposited in a timely manner.

<u>Cause</u>: The relief association officials did not provide a reason why this occurred.

<u>Effect</u>: As a result of the untimely receipt and deposit, funds were not available to pay general operating expenses or for investment purposes. In addition, an untimely receipt and deposit of funds increases the risk that funds could be lost or misappropriated.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials adopt internal control procedures to ensure the timely receipt and deposit of all future income received. For further guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

Finding No. 6 – Failure To Maintain A Complete And Accurate Membership Roster

<u>Condition</u>: The relief association officials did not maintain a complete and accurate roster of relief association members.

<u>Criteria</u>: Relief association officials should maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership, as identified by criteria set forth in the relief association's bylaws. A comprehensive roster of all relief association members should include the following:

- Names of each member
- Members' mailing addresses
- Dates of births
- Dates of memberships
- Membership classifications

Finding No. 6 – (Continued)

In addition, when warranted, a notation should be made on the roster identifying the date of a member's resignation or death.

<u>Cause:</u> The relief association officials indicated that they were unable to obtain membership rosters from two of the affiliated fire companies upon request.

<u>Effect</u>: The failure to maintain a comprehensive membership roster could result in the payment of benefits to nonmembers or deprive eligible relief association members from receiving authorized benefit payments.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that the relief association officials compile and maintain a complete and accurate roster of the relief association's membership. For additional guidance, please refer to the Auditor General's publication, MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTERS' RELIEF ASSOCIATIONS.

<u>Management's Response</u>: Relief association management agreed with the finding as presented at the audit exit conference and indicated they will take action to comply with the recommendation.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be subject to verification through our next audit.

CONYNGHAM TOWNSHIP FIREMAN'S RELIEF ASSOCIATION REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Joshua D. Shapiro

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Conyngham Township Fireman's Relief Association Governing Body:

Mr. Joseph Pavloski President

Mr. Marvin Honabach, Jr. Secretary

Mr. Gregory Yeager Treasurer

A report was also distributed to the following municipality, which allocated foreign fire insurance tax monies to this relief association:

Ms. Lee Ann Smith Secretary Conyngham Township

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <u>www.PaAuditor.gov.</u> Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: <u>news@PaAuditor.gov</u>.